
ICANN70 | Virtual Community Forum - ccNSO: Council meeting
Thursday, March 25, 2021 – 12:30 to 14:00 EST

KIMBERLY CARLSON: Hi, everyone, and welcome to today's ccNSO Council Public Meeting. My name is Kim Carlson, and I am today's remote participation manager. Please note that this session is being recorded and follows the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will only be read aloud if put in the proper form as noted in the chat. And Susie will put that in here shortly. We will read those questions or comments aloud during the time set by the chair or the moderator of this session.

If you would like to ask your comment or question verbally, please raise your hand. When called upon, kindly unmute your microphone and take the floor. Please state your name for the record and speak clearly and at a reasonable pace. Mute your microphone when you are done speaking.

And this session includes automated real time transcription. You will find that at the bottom on the Zoom toolbar called Closed Captioning. Please note that this transcript is not official or authoritative.

And with that, I'll hand the floor over to you, Katrina. Sorry about that. Thanks.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much, Kim. Hello. Good morning, good afternoon, good evening. That's a traditional phrase that we use nowadays to welcome everyone to the call. And today, we're having the ccNSO Council meeting, number 171.

We'll start with a welcome and a roll call. Have we received any apologies?

KIMBERLY CARLSON: I have not received any apologies.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. Thank you. So, I hope that everybody will be on the call today. May I ask again, once more, to remind current councilors, please, after your name in this participants list, state that you are from the ccNSO Council because we need to ensure that we're quorate, and it's easier to count if it's possible to immediately see who is on the call. So, thank you. I hope we are quorate.

Before we go to voting, there are some other things that we need to look into. Those are minutes and action items. Minutes have been circulated, so if you have any comments please share them. Then, as you can see, all action items and to-dos are completed. We've appointed members to OISC. That's apparently the only inter-meeting decision that we've had since 17 February which was the previous Council call.

Another thing that we need to formally ratify, as we discussed during the prep meeting, that we need to ratify [is the] chair and vice-chair election procedure. You see the draft background information and draft decision.

So, let's start. Anyone would like to—

BART BOSWINKEL: Kim, can you go to the next page, please? To where it is.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. It's not scrolling so well. So, anyone would like to move? Anyone would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita.

BYRON HOLLAND: I'll second it.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. Byron. Thank you. Yes, thanks. So, Margarita moved. Byron seconded. Any questions/comments on this?

Okay. If not, last question to the secretariat. I know they're desperately trying to count all the councilors because not all councilors have stated they are from the ccNSO Council, so it's it makes it more difficult to identify you guys. So, let's give it another 10 seconds and then I'll ask again.

So, are we quorate? Can anyone confirm?

BART BOSWINKEL: Yes, you are.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you so much. Steven, it looks like you're celebrating Halloween. I don't know why you're so bluishly-grayish. Okay.

So, we're quorate, which means that we can go to the voting. So, anyone against? None that I can see. Anyone abstains? Nope. Okay. Which means that we have formally ratified the procedure.

And now, as you may know, five councilors—me included—will step down after this meeting, and we have to do everything in our powers to make sure that you remain functional which means that we need to help you to formally elect the chair and vice-chairs.

Following the procedure we just approved, we had this nomination period, whatever it is. And we start with election of the ccNSO chair. So, we received one nomination. Alejandra Reynoso Barral from .gt, LAC region, was nominated. She was seconded. And, surprisingly, she

accepted her nomination. Which brings us to the decision. It means that we formally ...

Council selects and appointments Alejandra Reynoso Barral as chair of the ccNSO for a one-year—that's the traditional term—term starting at the end of ICANN70 and ending at the end of ICANN73.

So, anyone would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita moves.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I'll second.

KATRINA SATAKI: Was it Steven?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Yeah.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay. Stephen seconded. Thank you. Any questions? Any comments? Any suggestions? Alejandra [inaudible].

[YOUNG-EUM LEE]: Congratulations to Alejandra.

KATRINA SATAKI: We haven't formally voted yet, but yes, I join you in congratulating already. A little bit early, but still. No questions? Let's move to voting, then.

Anyone against? Anyone abstains? Nope. Thank you. Which means that, Alejandra, congratulations! And, well, what can I say? Be strong and we love you and we will support you in everything you do.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: So, thank you very much for being so brave and daring. It's not easy, you know, with this lot. And I mean ccNSO Council. Okay, excellent. Thank you very much. Congratulations, again.

Let's move to the next agenda item which is election of ccNSO vice-chairs because the chair needs a lot of support from the entire Council. But, yes, we have two great guys who were properly nominated, seconded. And, again, they also accepted their nomination. So, it's Jordan Carter from .nz, AP region, and Pablo Rodriguez from .pr, NA region.

Two guys, and I'm sure that they will provide all support to Alejandra, and they will help with everything that needs to be done.

So, decision. ccNSO selects and appoints Jordan Carter and Pablo Rodriguez as vice-chairs of the ccNSO for a one-year term—again, a traditional term—starting at the end of ICANN70 and ending at the end of ICANN73.

So, who would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita moved. Who would like to second?

BIYI OLADIPO: Biyi Oladipo.

KATRINA SATAKI: Biyi seconds. Thank you very much. So, any questions? Comments? Best wishes?

MARGARITA VALDES: Well, congratulations, but we didn't vote yet.

KATRINA SATAKI: That's true. Yes, yes. Okay. Let's formally vote for these two strong gentlemen. Okay. Anyone against? Anyone abstains? Everyone is in favor. Thank you very much. So, congratulations, guys. So, well done—we'll say in a year. But it's already, your first step [has already been]

made. So, thank you very much for your willingness to support Alejandra in this work. Thank you.

Okay. Now we can move forward. Now we have the official business done. You can continue with the voting, actually. So, the next one is adoption of the Guideline: ccNSO Appointments to Specific Groups.

As you may remember, the Guidelines Review Committee looked into the procedure that we usually use to appoint people to different groups. We wanted to have a guideline that would be universal, that would work for all appointments that do not have specific guidelines of their own. And then at the end, we thought that, “Okay. It's probably necessary to try and combine all those appointments into one guideline to make it easier for people to navigate and find the right bit.

So, it was presented to the Council. Then it was sent to the community for questions. We've received some minor editorial suggestions from Irina. So, they have all been implemented into the guideline. So—can I say, again—the decision is in front of you. So, we adopt the guideline and all the requests, secretariat [will] publish it, and it would become effective seven days after a publication.

So, anyone would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita moves. I think I heard Pablo who—

PABLO RODRIGUEZ: I did.

KATRINA SATAKI: —seconded. Okay, thank you. So, Margaret move. Pablo seconded. Excellent. Any question? Comments? No. Okay, thanks a lot.

We can go to voting, formally vote on the adoption of this guideline. Anyone against? No. Anyone abstains? Not that I see. Okay, thank you very much. So, it's adopted.

Next one. It's the procedure for nominating and selecting chairs and vice-chairs of ccNSO working groups and committees. Again, just as a reminder, we always thought that the procedure is quite clear. And it was very, very briefly discussed in our guidelines. But at some point, it turned out that, for newcomers, our traditional methods of selecting chairs and vice-chairs are not entirely clear. So, there was a need to make this procedure clearer so that we can avoid misunderstandings.

So, that was done. Procedure was proposed by the Guidelines Review Committee. Again, it was sent to the Council. Then it was sent to members. Now, after adoption, these procedures will be incorporated into existing guidelines. That's on ccNSO working groups and ccNSO collaboration groups.

As all of you see the decision, again, in front of you. Same thing. We approve the request, the secretariat to publish, and after seven days,

according to the rules of the ccNSO, the procedures will become effective.

Okay, so let's go to the formal ... I think. Anyone would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita moves. Pablo has his hand up, so I assume Pablo seconds. Thank you very much. Okay. Can we proceed to formal voting, then? Anyone against? I can't see anyone. Anyone abstains? No. Okay. It means that the procedure has been adopted. Thank you very much.

Let's move to the next agenda item which is the appointment of Alireza Saleh as our ccNSO liaison to GNSO IDN policy development efforts group. Again, I hope you remember all the story. GNSO has appointed their liaison to our IDN ccPDP group. And Alireza will be our liaison to this group to make sure that we can coordinate our policy efforts.

So, decision. Again, you see in front of you. Appoint Alireza as liaison on Council's request. Secretariat to inform the GNSO and, of course, Alireza about this appointment as soon as feasible.

So, let's proceed to a formal moving. Anyone would like to move?

PABLO RODRIGUEZ: Pablo.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I'll second. Deerhake, here.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay, yeah. So, Pablo moved. Stephen seconded. Thank you. Excellent. Let's vote, then. Anyone against? Anyone abstains? No. Which means that everyone is in favor. Thank you very much. Congratulations to Alireza and, congratulations to the ccPDP 4 Working Group and, of course, ccNSO. That's an excellent choice.

So, thank you let's move to the next agenda item: adoption of roles and responsibilities. So, as we've discussed during the beginning of the workshop and during prep meeting, everyone is invited to look into the list table of roles and responsibilities and volunteer to do things. And that does not apply to those five councilors who stepped down after ICANN70, it does apply to those councilors who will join ccNSO Council after ICANN70.

Well, it looks like people are not very eager to volunteer to do all the things that need to be done, which means that today we still cannot formally approved all those roles and responsibilities, because we just don't have enough volunteers.

So, according to this decision, as you can see, councilors are invited to look at the table again and, well, volunteer to those roles. If suddenly we get too many volunteers for one position, so those councilors will be

invited to discuss and agree among themselves. If they can't, then you just see the procedure that going to be the following procedure.

So, I see Irina asks where to find the list. It was sent to the mailing list, but we will definitely resend it. When I say “we,” I mean you because some of us will be gone. So, you will have to sort this with the new chair. And if you hope that—

BART BOSWINKEL: “We” as the queen of the ccNSO.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes, exactly. So, if you think that the new chair of the ccNSO will not force you to adopt these roles and responsibilities, think again. This is not going to happen. Trust me. She will make appointments. Either you volunteer or you will be voluntold.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Katrina, I think I got the hint of a short-timer’s attitude from you here just now.

KATRINA SATAKI: I’m enjoying every minute. And I’m sure that you will ... These things need to be done, so one way or the other, they will be assigned. So, please, please, please volunteer.

Okay. You see the decision. Anyone would like to move?

YOUNG-EUM LEE: Young-eum.

KATRINA SATAKI: Young-eum. Thank you.

SOULEYMANE OUMTANAGA: Souleymane.

KATRINA SATAKI: Souleymane seconded. Thank you. Right? Okay. So, any questions? Any comments? Suggestions? No.

Okay. I see Young-eum smiles. Margarita smiles in the chat. Yes, exactly, because this is our last meeting. So, let's vote, then. Anyone votes against? Hope. Anyone abstains? Nope. So, everyone is in favor. Good. Okay.

Let's move to the next agenda item, then. Yeah, the review of the governance session. And we have to discuss the call for volunteers to join this sub-working group of GRC to work on the roles of the ccNSO. I saw many of you during that session, joining the session. So, any comments? Anything you'd like to say about the sessions or what was your feeling? Because you did the exercise before, so we looked into those potential topics to be include or not to be included in the rules. So, are there any ... So, what was your takeaway from that session?

Yes, Stephen? Oh, now you're not blue anymore.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Yeah. Zoom's not been playing well with me all week, actually. So, I shut it off and turned it back on.

I thought it was a great session. I thought it went really well. Chris did a great job, as one would expect from Chris. And I think he's really got the group focused on a way forward with the sub-group. So, I thought it went exceptionally well, to tell you the truth. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. Any other comments? Anyone would like to share their thoughts? Okay, David agrees in chat. David is also on the GRC, the Guidelines Review Committee. And Pablo agrees, too. Okay, excellent. Let's hope we'll get volunteers to work on the rules [of the] ccNSO. And, yeah, I agree. I agree with Nigel who said that this is a very ambitious timeline that we proposed. But let's hope that it would work.

Bart.

BART BOSWINKEL: Just one thing for the record. Joke made some notes, and the real-time transcript is available as well. So, the GRC can use, I would say, the whole conversation as input. So, that's good in moving this forward. Thanks.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. Thank you very much. Some more details about this. So, the idea is that we invite people to this sub-group, so they do not become formal members of GRC. So, there's no need for the Council to approve them as members. And they will be free to go or apply as members to the GRC if they'd like. But to work on these documents ...

Yes, and we also have Zoom recording from the session, actually.

So, they will not become ... Council will not need to approve their membership because they will not be members. So, they will walk away when the rules of the ccNSO is done. That's the proposal here.

So, anyone would like to move?

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita.

KATRINA SATAKI: Margarita. Thank you. Seconders? Any? Young-eum, I see your hand up. Yeah, thank you. Okay, excellent. Any questions/comments on this one? Nope. Okay, then let's ... Yes, Stephen?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I agree with Nigel that the schedule is really ambitious, but we'll see what happens.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes, but if we give them more time, they will use all the time allocated.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: That's what my working groups do.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes, exactly. So, let's proceed with the suggested timeline and then ... Well, if it doesn't work out, it doesn't work out. What can I say? There's always another year when we talk about ICANN and our plans here. Okay.

So, let's vote than. Anyone in against? No. Anyone abstains? No. So, everyone is in favor. Thank you very much. Let's move forward, then. Okay.

And that's [the initial] discussion on the Annual Work Plan because there are still many, many things that need to be done. That list never will go away. And it's very important to identify those things that must be done, that would be nice to do. And maybe even more importantly, is to get rid of those things that do not need to be ... Best not to waste energy there.

So, may I ask here, Bart, to walk us through?

BART BOSWINKEL: Yeah. Thank you. Yeah. So, I'll do it very briefly. Most of you will have seen it, but it's good to have this as—I would say—as a package so you can look at it at your leisure. Go to the next slide please, Kim.

So, as you recall, the Council had a workshop in, I think it was June 2020, where you discussed the purpose and the value of the ccNSO for the ccTLDs and broader community. Next slide, please.

And, yeah, this was more or less the result of that discussion. And you can go to the next slide as well. Those of you who have been participating in presentations on onboarding, etc., will have seen this. And this is ... I think everybody is very comfortable with this Purpose and Values Statement around the ccNSO. Next slide, please.

And as part of the decision making and the further discussion by the Council, the secretariat looked at the original 2020/2022 work items and mapped them against the Purpose Statement as recorded. And this looked like a huge mind map, and it's concise.

I've shared that mind map before. I think it was the August Council meeting. And it worked very well, but I didn't want to bother you with the huge mind map. I'll update it to do it again just so we have—or share it with you again—if you're interested. But it includes all the work items to date. I need to update it. Yeah, that's one thing. Can you go to the next slide, Kim?

So, the mapping was fine. But if we start looking ... And this is what this is about. The annual work plan and the ccNSO guideline around it, it's very clear that what is listed in that guideline does not match the Purpose and Values Statement of the ccNSO anymore.

The item list needs to be updated, and the working methods, etc., have not been followed to the letter. And I think, Stephen, this is something for you to look into.

So, that's clearly one of the things that needs to be done moving forward and before updating the Annual Work Plan. It might be useful, and that would be the proposal. Is first to revisit the working methods, etc., around the Annual Work Plan, given its importance going forward and also in the discussions with other SOs and ACs. Next slide, please. So, related—next slide, please.

Related is how, for example, the current guideline includes new work items in the working plan. Next slide, please.

So, this is all the excerpt. So, the current method of prioritization of work items. So, again, according to the guideline, first level of importance and urgency, you can see how they're defined. Next slide, please.

And then the relative priority of resourcing of the work items needs to be determined. Based on experience today, I can tell you—and there is a role for the Triage Committee, etc. Based on the experience to date, it's done but it's not shared and not undertaken by the broader Council. We discuss it at points, but it probably needs to be more highlighted. Next slide, please.

So, if you would look at this method, in short it is what is called, I think in the literature, the Eisenhower Matrix or the Eisenhower Method. So, you saw it with ... You only do and focus on things that are urgent and

important. And probably what is not important and not urgent, you eliminate.

That's the theory, but if you'll recall from some of these exercises you did doing Council workshops, at the end of the day everything ends up again ... All the work items end up, again, to be important. Maybe not urgent, but definitely important. So, you always end up in one or two. So, it's not very ... It doesn't distinguish a lot. Next slide, please.

So, there are alternative approaches as well, and Katrina already alluded a little bit to it. And that's more looking at the impact and effort as a prioritization mechanism. And, again, what is an ... So, talking about an impact effort matrix ... Yeah, this is a lot of matrices. Next slide, please.

So, what it really boils down to is that you look at issues/work items and assess the impact on the ccTLD community, etc. And what is very important is how much effort it will take to complete this work item or address the issue. Next slide, please.

You end up, again, with four squares. And this is another way, and you can read at it. So, again, high impact but low effort is quick and easy wins. Some would call it low-hanging fruit. You can read it.

Major projects/big bets. It's a little bit like a PDP. They have a high impact, but they also have a high effort. They need a lot of planning, and they are very time consuming. But, again, they're very important to use the Eisenhower Matrix and then fill in the incrementals. Or maybe you want to do them, maybe you don't.

And then you also have the money pit or the time sinks. People put in a lot of effort, but it hardly contributes. And if you would have listened to the conversation on the Q&A with the Board, maybe this is the area of the ccNSO review. Next slide, please.

So, what needs to be done next? And this is what you will see in the proposed resolution. So, I think first of all—and there shouldn't be a question mark—but the Council, at one point, needs to select and develop a more solid method of prioritization which then can be used to update the work, or to really look at the work items and include them in the annual planning document.

Secondly—and this is what you discussed last week on the prep call—is the role of the Triage Committee. If you would look in more detail at the guideline, there is already an advisory role for the Triage Committee with respect to the Annual Work Plan and the Monthly Work Plan. And include those work items.

To date, I think, I believe the Triage Committee has not been involved in any way or form in this work. They've identified work items which are relevant, or the relevancy of work items. But, yeah, this is ... Probably a more expanded role of the Triage Committee might be very useful, also, in dividing the work and overseeing the work of the secretariat in this realm and combining identifying new issues and putting them in a more manageable format in the Annual and Monthly Work Plans.

And then based on these two action items, update the work plan and adjust the guideline which could be done fairly easily once you've

agreed on the method of prioritization and the mandate and the role of the Triage Committee, etc.

Thanks. That's all I had to say about this. Back to you, Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. Before we go to question, this is a short comment. Bart, your clock is two minutes late.

So, any questions? No? Everything is clear? Maybe any suggestions? No. Okay. Then let's move back to the agenda.

BART BOSWINKEL: Jordan has his hand up.

KATRINA SATAKI: Jordan, okay. Sorry, I didn't see that. Jordan.

JORDAN CARTER: Sorry, Katrina. It was just a last-minute [inaudible] hand. I think that the expanded mandate for the Triage Committee makes sense here. But I think we'll just have to do it for a year and see how much extra work it creates. If it ends up being a really big job, we might need to think of a different way to do it. So, I just wanted to note that.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay, thank you. That's a fair point. Okay, let's try and see how it works for a year. Those who volunteered to do Triage Committee work, yes,

that will be up to you to see how it works, develop more efficient methods.

Okay. If no further comments, so the idea you see here is basically just what Bart explained. So, the decision is that ... Well, considering the increased value of planning a coherent method for setting priorities, we request the current draft committee and secretariat to propose a roadmap to integrate the work of the Triage Committee and management of the Annual and Monthly Work Plan.

Should we add that this decision will be reviewed in a years' time?

KIMBERLY CARLSON: Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yep.

KIMBERLY CARLSON: Xavier Calvez has his hand up.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay, Xavier.

XAVIER CALVEZ: Thank you, Katrina. Just a very quick comment to say that Org is working on developing—similarly to what Bart just presented for the ccNSO—a prioritization framework which is, of course, looking very

similar in a draft form to what has been presented. This prioritization framework is aiming at prioritizing the entirety of the work of ICANN. And as you work through the approach that has been presented today, I think that there will be a lot of mutual benefits in sharing experiences.

And your participation in the overall prioritization of the work of ICANN will be very welcome. And before that, of course, we will seek feedback from the ccNSO through the SOPC, but also through the rest of the members.

As desired on that framework, what we are developing is simply a starting point for community engagement, so we will share this with all the SOs and ACs, and engage with each of them on that framework and providing input, etc.

So, I just wanted to flag that. There are multiple efforts being carried out on how to prioritize, and I think we're all trying to do more or less the same thing. So, I just wanted to flag that. Thank you, Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Yeah. Thank you very much, Xavier. Okay, so getting back to my question, should we add that this decision should be reviewed until next year to ICANN73?

BART BOSWINKEL:

Katrina?

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes.

BART BOSWINKEL: I think I really understand Jordan's point, but if you look at the decision itself, it's ... Look, this is going to wind up in a proposal, and fairly quickly. And I think once this has been done and the Triage Committee is ... This is just an exploration on changes. It will involve a change ... Or the result will be a change in the guideline.

The result will be an adoption and a change and a mandate of the Triage Committee and an update of the Annual Work Plan. And hopefully by May, but maybe that might be too optimistic given all the other work items. I'm an optimist by nature.

I think, at that time, that's the point where you as a Council should decide whether to do it for the updated role of the Triage Committee for a year and when you want to review it because I think that's one of the things that's been lacking to date, the real review of the working method around the Annual Work Plan.

We had workshops around it. We tried it with prioritization at the time, etc., using the method from importance and urgency. But yet, we ended up with the whole list. So, just leave it as it is. And, definitely, there needs to be a review in it once you adopt the new mandate of the Triage Committee and the updated guideline. Thanks.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. So, currently, it's what it is. Anyone would like to move? Alejandra.

JORDAN CARTER: Yeah, I can second.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. Jordan seconds. Thank you very much. So, any further comments/questions here? I don't see any.

Okay. In that case, let's move to voting. Anyone against? I see none. Anyone abstains? Nope. Everyone is in favor. So, thank you very much. And thanks a lot to the Triage Committee. And thank you, Bart, for presenting the [potential] way forward.

Okay. Let's move to the next agenda item, then. ccPDP 3, Part 1 on the retirement. So, there are no further updates about the review mechanism. So, Stephen.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Thank you, Katrina. If I could go back to retirement update real quick. The report is out for public comment. It ends on the 14th of April. There have been no comments received to date, although curiously I did get a press inquiry.

With regards to the review mechanism, we are continuing at pace. We, as you know, had ICANN Legal, Sam Eisner, come visit us for one of our calls and we hope to have her back, I believe on the next call depending

on the progress we've made in trying to drill down on a review mechanism that makes sense for us for this process.

And we did not meet this week. We are scheduled to meet, I believe, next Wednesday. But it might be the Wednesday after. Bart can clarify that for me because I don't have it. Bart, do you have any other comments about where we are with the review mechanism?

BART BOSWINKEL: No, not at all. No.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI: Yeah. Thank you very much. Are there any questions?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Any questions?

KATRINA SATAKI: Nope. Don't see any. Okay, thank you. Let's move to the next agenda item, then, and that's IDN ccPDP4 update. Bart, will you present this?

BART BOSWINKEL: Yes. I can do that. So, as I reported to you—or [inaudible] already reported to you, the variant management sub-group has kicked off its

work, and the full working group is also engaging every two weeks. So, every week there is an IDN Working Group meeting or related meeting.

The progress of the full group is ... Let me rephrase it. The working group has really picked up the pace. We're going over the original proposal to the Board, and we've concluded the first reading of the requirements. So, that's almost a milestone.

We'll now look into the technical criteria which probably doesn't take very long as well, but the working method starts to pay off, and everybody is very comfortable about it. So, I think that's ...

And what the Variant Management Working Group is trying to get its head around is what variants are and how to define them because it's quite an issue. It depends very much on the level you look at it whether you talk ... For example, are variants something like car and auto? Or are variants only within scripts?

And they found their way forward as well. And they say they are building and will build upon the original recommendations from ICANN staff which has also been the basis for the work within, I believe it was SubPro. But that needs to be confirmed. Back to you, Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much, Bart. Any questions or updates? Okay. No. Then let's move to the next agenda item which is updates from ECA and CSC. Let's start with Empowered Community Administration. Stephen, anything?

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Thank you, Katrina. The rejection action period for approval of the IANA FY22 budget expired, and so there was nothing filed with the ECA. So, that expired and I just wrote ICANN Legal, the secretary, to inform him of that. We will be getting into our busy season between now and the end of the fiscal year with the approval of the strategic plan and the overall ICANN budget. And membership has remained stable for 33 days now, so that's impressive.

That's it for me. Any questions?

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. I see no hands. Okay, let's move to CSC. Alejandra.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Yes, thank you. [This time] the PTI met the Service Legal Agreement at 98.4% for the month of February. They missed one Service Level Agreement which was satisfactorily explained, so there's no indication of any performance issue. And there was also the election of the chair and vice-chair of the CSC, and it remained the same: chair Lars-Johan Liman and vice-chair Brett Carr. And that's it for me.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. Any questions/comments on this? No. Let's move to the next agenda item, then, which is any other updates from chairs, vice-chairs, councilors, regional organizations, secretariat? Anyone

would like to share anything that has happened since our meeting in February? No, okay.

Very well, then. Update from working groups? SOPC. Anything you'd like to share, Giovanni?

GIOVANNI SEPPIA:

Hi, Katrina. Yes, thank you. ICANN has published, on the 18th of March, the report on the comments they received, including the SOPC comments. I did not have time to go through the report. I'll do it in the next days. We had submitted several comments, and we received some questions from ICANN staff on some of the comments which we provided for their clarification.

So, the work for me and the SOPC will be, in the next days, to review the preliminary feedback that ICANN has been provided to the different comments. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much. Any questions for Giovanni? No. Then next is the Internet Governance Liaison Committee. They just had a very interesting session/discussion today, earlier today. At least earlier today in my time zone. I don't know, maybe it was yesterday for some others. But, yeah, it was a very interesting discussion so we know what they're doing, where they're going.

Then I see, also, an update from Tech Day, Tech Working Group, basically. Yeah, Stephen.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Tech Day was a ... I thought it was a great success. I have to say the first two papers just went right over my head, and I felt like I was in some serious academic conference. It was well attended. There were well over 100 attendees for most of it, and it ran very smoothly. So, planning's underway for the next one. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay. Thank you very much. Okay. Update from liaisons, and we'll get written updates.

Next meetings. Regarding the next meetings, we planned them in advance. That's April 22 at 12:00 UTC and May 20 at 18:00 UTC. But with the ... Well, meetings after that will be planned by the new chairs. I believe you will receive information very soon.

Okay, that's good. Then any other business? Is there anything anyone would like to raise here? I don't know. I see that Joke shared that the MPC meets tomorrow.

Then I see that Byron has his hand up. Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thanks, Katrina. I just wanted to put on the record and in the minutes, since this will be my last time, how much I've appreciated all the work that the staff has done over all these years. And they showed it again today what great work they do. So Bart, Joke, Kim, and their predecessors—just a big thank you to the staff who support us all in all

the good work that we get to do. Within them, we wouldn't get to do what we do. So, I just want to say thank you very much to the staff team.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Yeah. Thank you very much. Much now we're smoothly moving into this thank you part. And here I was told that I'm conflicted, so I have to give the floor—or the screen—to the new chair, Alejandra. And then I'll get it back for the closure. Some thanks from me and the closure. Okay, Alejandra.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thank you, Katrina. I do promise to give it back to you. So, let me first thank all presenters, participants, attendees, and the meetings program committee for all the work and show of interest. It was an exhaustive period, but we achieved a lot and showed that ccTLDs are alive and kicking even in these times when we are in one virtual meeting after another.

We have listened to very interesting and lively presentations, starting with the ccTLD news prior to the ICANN meeting itself. Then Tech Day on Monday. The governance session and Q&A with the ccTLD-related Board members on Tuesday. And the future ccTLDs Wednesday.

I also wanted to thank ICANN staff support for their fabulous job and for taking care of us. As Byron just said, we wouldn't be able to do this without your unconditional assistance. So, thank you very much.

Next, I want to welcome our new councilors. Normally, we do this at the end of this item, but this is the first time in the history of the ccNSO that five councilors will step down including three vice-chairs and two chairs. So, I hope you will forgive me in welcoming the new councilors first.

The ccNSO Council welcomes Ali Hadji from the African region, Jiankang Yao from the Asian Pacific region, Irina Danelia from the European region, Jenifer Lopez from Latin America and the Caribbean region, and Sean Copeland from the North American region.

All are new councilors and, undoubtedly, the first couple of meetings you will be feeling very strange. But don't worry. I can tell from experience that sooner than you think, you will understand the flow and how it works. And if there is anything you don't quite understand, please don't be afraid to ask.

Now, on behalf of the Council and the whole community, I wholeheartedly thank the following councilors for their service at the community and Council: Abdalla Omari from the African region, Young-eum Lee from the Asia Pacific region, Katrina Sataki from the European region, Margarita Valdes from the Latin America and the Caribbean region, and Byron Holland from the North American region.

All of them participated in working groups, Council committees, study groups, and cross-community working groups; and were instrumental in what the ccNSO has achieved over the years, introducing IDN ccTLDs, adoption of the Framework of Interpretation, reached an understanding on the ccTLD financial contribution to ICANN, the

transition of the IANA Stewardship, and Work Stream 1 Accountability, and the launch of two to three Policy Development Processes.

Looking at this from another perspective, with the departure of these five magnificent people from the ccNSO Council, we lose 52 years of experience including 12 years of vice-chair experience and seven years of chair experience. But first and foremost, we lose people who, through our work together, have become our friends.

Now, in record time, I will go through those 52 years of experience in a few minutes. So, Abdalla. He was a member of the first Customer Standing Committee Effectiveness Review Team and our Approval Action Process Manager. Though it took us a bit of convincing, he chaired the IANA sessions during the members meeting flawlessly. Thank you, Abdalla.

Margarita. She has been in various selection committees like Ethos, now Community Excellence Award Committee; the Council CSC Selection committee. She was a member of the Triage Committee and the ccNSO Review Working Party; and one of the direct links to the Latin America and the Caribbean members. Thank you, Margarita.

Young-eum. Our longest-serving ccNSO councilor ever, since 2004.1. Vice-chair of the ccNSO, co-chair of the Study Group Wildcarding, co-chair of the joint ccNSO-GAC IDN Working Group, member of the ccNSO Delegation and Redelegation Working Group, member of the Ad-hoc Group (Protection of Country Names), member of the Internet Governance Coordination Committee, member of Guidelines Review

Committee, member of the Travel Funding Committee, Member of the Rejection Action Petition Committee.

And we undoubtedly are forgetting to mention [some more] roles. But on a personal note, you always made sure we didn't miss important details to keep our good relationships, and reminded us about our human nature. Thank you very much, Young-eum.

Now, I want to add some remarks for the people whose footsteps I will follow. First, Byron. While participating actively in many working groups and committees, he chaired or cochaired many of them such as the Drafting Team, CWG Stewardship, the IANA Transition and Accountability Coordination Committee, Group Internet Governance Coordination Committee, and the Finance Working Group. He was also chair and vice-chair of the ccNSO Council.

But what I want to highlight now is his role as first chair of the Customer Standing Committee, the CSC. I have seen from close by—as his successor as a member of the CSC—what has been achieved under his tenure. All processes and procedures are in place so that if it ever came to an issue, we have a way to work through it. As the current chair of the CSC says, “Byron is good, so we fortunately have had no need to test the procedures.” Thank you very much, Byron, for everything.

Next, of course, I want to highlight Katrina. But before I do, I want to give the floor to David Olive, Senior Vice President Policy Support. Please, David.

DAVID OLIVE: Thank you, Madam Chairman—I hope I can still call you Alejandra—

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Of course.

DAVID OLIVE: —and members of the outgoing and incoming members of the Council. I quickly wanted to say a few words. We had a pre-COVID tradition with the Policy Team to go to a new incoming chair and brief the person about the roles. And Bart and I did go to Riga to visit Katrina. And it was part of that process to learn about the role of the .lv registry, but also to get to know Katrina, that we built a good relationship. And over the hot lunch, as opposed to the dry Dutch sandwiches, we were able to establish that relationship over the years; both to promote your activities in the ccNSO, work with the supporting organizations and advisory council chairs, and organizing the work of the ICANN meetings.

So, with that I would like to wish you well in your next steps on the Board, congratulation the new leadership—Alejandra, Jordan, and Pablo. I’m looking forward to establishing that relationship. Even though I might not have a chance to get to Guatemala in person, we can do it a virtual Guatemala visit. Congratulations, and thank you for this opportunity.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you very much, David. Looking forward for the virtual meeting in Guatemala. Now, I would like to give the floor to Byron Holland as former ccNSO chair. Please, Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Alejandra—future chair. So, let’s talk about the just recently past, sort of present chair, Katrina. And I think I’ll just start because it’s been a long-running joke with Katrina and I because I think the first time I introduced her I called her Kristina which she has never, never let me live down. So, Katrina, it has been—I think like all of our councilors here would say—a pleasure working with you over the years.

Of course, you and I are now part of a very small club of former chairs of the ccNSO. And we had an interesting history because we’ve both been vice-chairs, chairs. And then I was your vice-chair as you were chair for a while. So, I’ve had a real benefit of working with Katrina for quite a number of years.

And I remember certainly, as the vice-chair, we were in the heady days of the IANA Transition. And as she was vice-chair during that period, she was in incredible support for this whole community because that allowed me to focus on that particular set of issues. And Katrina really helped make the whole Council run effectively, certainly with her work on the Program Working Group keeping all the wheels on the bus and us headed in the right direction. And really helps to candle the whole process during that period which was incredibly important for all of us.

And then as she transitioned into chair, I had the opportunity to work with her in that early transition period very closely. And one of the things I always really loved watching was her work in the SO/AC Leaders meeting with Göran. And I can tell you, watching that firsthand, there is no chair who has better managed Göran than our chair, Katrina.

And in those meetings, I really—I really—appreciated not only her sense of humor—which I guess there’s some northern sort of Nordic northern thing going; I know that you’re not a Nordic country, but in that neighborhood—a sense of humor that’s quite unique. But also, her willingness to just tell it like it is with no regard for who’s on the receiving end of it, in that she tell is equally to everybody—Göran and everybody else.

And I always really admired the fact that she certainly didn’t leave any question with what her thoughts are or were. And that has served us very well as a community, and I know it’s going to serve us very well now that she has gone on to, or will be shortly, moving on to the ICANN Board.

So, thank you for all you’ve done. And thank you for what I know you will be doing on that Board. And I know that the ccNSO community will still continue to be extremely well served by you. It’s been an honor, my friend. Thank you.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you very much, Byron. We have a video that was previously shared with the community early this week, and I thought it would be nice to share it here, too. Kim, please could you play the video?

CLAUDIO RUIZ (VIDEO): Thanks for joining us today.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): We want to take a moment to let Katrina know how much she's mean to us over the last few years.

KIMBERLY CARLSON (VIDEO): We are immensely grateful for the work you've done with the ccNSO.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): You made it feel like a true partnership.

CLAUDIA RUIZ (VIDEO): And also grateful for your sense of humor, dedication, [lightness], and most of all, friendship.

KIMBERLY CARLSON (VIDEO): And for that special Latvian medicine.

GIOVANNI SEPPIA (VIDEO): I prepared some tissues just in case I'm getting too much touched by this good-bye video.

AI-CHIN LU (VIDEO): Thank you for your contribution to the ccNSO community, and wish you all the best and the success.

HIROFUMI HOTTA (VIDEO): We love your strong leadership with full of love, smile, and [confidence].

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): We would also like to wish you the best luck in the ICANN Board position. We are certain that things will be in good hands when they are in your hands.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): My best wishes for you in your new role at the ICANN Board. And I will miss you so much. So, for me, this is a see you soon. It's not a good-bye. Much kisses for you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE (VIDEO): And we are looking forward to meeting you soon in the future.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE (VIDEO): I would say that you are a charismatic leader, and your beauty helped you to [guard] people, moreover men.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): I know that you are a high-level professional and beautiful woman.

KRISTINE LAKOBYAN (VIDEO): [speaking Latvian]

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): You are amazing, so congratulations once again. And we look forward to collaborating for you [further] for many years.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE (VIDEO): Thank you very much for being our chair of the ccNSO with so much dedication, energy, focus, and humor.

JORDAN CARTER (VIDEO): I love your style and the thinking that you bring to the work. I'm sure you'll take that with you to the ICANN Board. It will be great to see what kind of trouble you can get yourself into there.

BART BOSWINKEL (VIDEO): A cow should never forget it was a calf, so all the best and never forget where you came from. Take care. Bye-bye.

[IRINA DANELIA (VIDEO)]: You became a great leader for this community, but also managed to give attention to every single member.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): I hope you remain as you are. Thank you.
Bye.

GIOVANNI SEPPIA: I had two people looking after us, and I'll show you who the two people were. So, I'm sure you can see them. Yes. [Popey, Popey]. And then you. So, thank you so much for what you have done for us. And thank you for having been a great ccNSO chair. Love you.

[music]

CLAUDIA RUIZ (VIDEO): We're going to miss you so very much.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE (VIDEO): As the quote goes, "Good friends never say good-bye. We simply say see you soon!"

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Such a great video. And now, I would like to say a few words to you, Katrina. Since you were appointed as the chair of the Meeting Program Working Group when it was that, I could sense your will to make things better with enthusiasm and energy, expecting always the best of us. With an open mind that provoked creativity, you inspired the team to think outside the box and an evolution started. Now, we enjoy the benefits of [that. We all] have gone into motion.

You are a natural leader in trusting your team members and supporting them all the way, giving them space and confidence while correcting them with care. You are a role model for all of us.

As I have told you before, you believed in me when I couldn't see it for myself, and I thank you so much for trusting me, for encouraging me, for empowering me. I wouldn't be here without your guidance and support. Thank you with all my heart.

I am certain that you will shine your light wherever you go, and that the ICANN Board won the biggest prize with you. This is definitely not a good-bye. We will try to keep you very close to us. The ccNSO is your home, and we will always be here for you. Thank you very much, Katrina. Back to you.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you so, so ... Well, it's really difficult to say anything after all the nice words you said and wrote in the chat. So, thank you very, very much. I will try to say something although I'm sure I will [undoubtedly] miss many things I wanted to say. So, I hope that one day we will meet and there will be an opportunity to say everything that I just might forget to say now.

Well, I really consider you all friends, and it has been a great honor and privilege, and a once in a lifetime opportunity and experience to work with all of you over these years. And if we now met in person, if we were in Cancún, I would be immensely happy to hug and thank every one of you.

And I'd like to welcome all the incoming councilors and to give a folder, the black folder, for evil plans to each of the outgoing councilors. And actually get one myself because I was looking forward to that moment ever since I joined the Council and saw the first departing councilors to get those fantastic folders.

Of course, I was full of doubt when I joined the Council, as [Gabby] very well knows. I'm still full of doubts, but now I definitely have learned to hide it better. And I learned a lot from [each] one of you. And please do not blame yourself if ... It's not yourself if what I learned is not entirely what you would have liked me to learn.

But believe me, I tried to learn from each of you because each of you are fantastic, and there's so much I can learn from everyone.

Thanks a lot to ... Oh, I remember when I became a vice-chair. Byron was chairing, and he was calm and he knew everything. And he could handle any situation. And Keith, with his experience, was also always there. Yeah. It was great to learn from every, every one of you. I wouldn't be here without you because one person cannot everything, cannot do anything. It's always a team's work.

So, I'm not going to have a long speech trying to teach you what to do and how to do after these five councilors leave. I know you all very well. You don't need that. I know that the ccNSO is in fantastic, great hands. These wonderful individuals are dedicated to have ccNSO moving forward.

But one thing I will say, though, is Bertrand Russell's quote. And I have shared it with several people since I joined the Council. And that is, "One of the symptoms of an approaching nervous breakdown is the belief that one's work is terribly important." So, be careful and try to avoid a nervous breakdown as much as possible. So, have fun. Really enjoy what you're doing because that's the key.

So, yeah, there are many people I want to thank, and it's difficult to do it. But there are people I really can't miss—current Council, ccNSO members. I remember when we were sitting face to face at a table, and it was so great to see people sitting, every meeting, in the same place. And it had this feeling of calmness and possibility to see things as they are and feel support from the community. Of course, all my friends who encouraged me to work on those working groups and then go to the Council.

I would like to thank David Olive for his continuous support and [all of his] efforts to make sure that SO/ACs receive all the support they need to accomplish their work. And that, of course, brings me to our fantastic ccNSO secretariat.

Eisenhower, and I think the spelling is the same, but I think it's another Eisenhower—not the one who came up with that important metric. Here, we're talking about President Eisenhower. He said that, "It's better to have one person working with you than three people working for you." And we have three and one-eighths, currently. Three and one-eighths people working with us. And even more people who used to be

with us, and those who still are with us who help whenever it's necessary.

Thanks a lot, dear ladies. First, when we started with Gabriele and Kristina. I almost called her Katrina. Sorry. No, she was Kristina. And then there's Claudia, Joke, Kathy, Kim, Maria—of course, she's not with us, with ccNSO anymore—Suzie, Tanzanica.

And, of course, Bart. The tallest guy with the loudest voice in ICANN who, even after all these years shocks me every time—every time—when he fetches the right historic document from only he knows where. Or he remembers meeting number of the meeting and who said what and what was discussed, what was decided. So, Bart, thank you. Thank you very much for your support, for your guidance, and all the knowledge that you've so generously shared with me.

Well, with so many great people around you, nothing can go wrong. So, let me say another quote that's from Margaret Mead. She's an American anthropologist. She said, "Never doubt that a small group of thoughtful, committed people can change the world. Indeed, it is the only thing that ever has."

So, yeah. I really would have loved to be with you now. But, yeah, that's unfortunately not the case. So, thank you. Thank you, everyone. Byron, for your leadership and your wise and calm advice. Alejandra, for your energy and your support and your wishfulness to continue this work.

And Pablo, I really appreciate [that] you always have my back. That's one thing. Another thing, you always know what to say to a woman, and that's a really great gift.

Young-eum, ICANN kiss is something that I miss. So, it was great to ... Yeah, you've always been there and you always know the right question to ask.

Stephen, you know sometimes I wanted to kill you, to be honest. But you're still alive, which means that probably nothing can kill you. That's why you survived COVID, you know? Because if you can survive me, you'll survive anything.

And Jordan, what I like about you, you'll never pull a dead horse. I'll give that to you. If you see a dead horse, you just leave it and say, "Let's go find a motorcar or something." You don't try to pull it. I have this issue. Sometimes I try to pull a dead horse, and well, you taught me not to. You taught me just let it rot. Forget it.

Margarita. Well, your singing, your open personality, your welcoming spirit has always inspired me.

Okay, Javier, you joined us recently. And it's a great pleasure, and I thank you for appreciating ccNSO the way you do, and your active participation.

Demi, another calm, wise, knowledgeable person. You are the vice-chair and, yeah, I remember how you ... You know how to ask a question. You know how to come up with a comment and say

something that is really to the point. And I tried to learn that from you, but I'll probably ... Maybe I won't.

Laura, you're another really bright personality. Thank you so much for bringing this joy of participation to the ccNSO.

Sébastien recently joined. I just am going through the list. I already spoke about the secretariat. Sébastien, it's good to have GNSO people—oh, GNSO people. You're a kind of ccNSO person. Right?

Okay. I'm really afraid to miss people. Ai-Chin, you are a real example of dedication. When you get up in the middle of the night to join ccNSO calls, I really admire you. And I wish I could have the same dedication and the same spirit to participation. So, really I appreciate it and respect.

Biyi, I love you. Really. Somehow, you also bring a calm thing to our meetings, to the sessions that you chair. And it's really fantastic, so thank you very much.

Okay, where are the other councilors? Giovanni, you are ... Well, [inaudible]. And you make any event memorable. I tried to learn that from you, too, how to find the right words for everything.

Okay. Peter van Roste and Barrack Otieno, and Nacho, and Leonid from regional organizations. I know that sometimes you think that we wanted to take away your job. No, that's definitely not the case.

Souleymane. Oh, I remember Souleymane. I will never forget Souleymane because he's really fantastic. When I see him at ICANN meetings, again, that brings so much calm to me.

And, of course, Abdalla. I still remember Abibu. When you laugh, it makes me laugh, too. And that's a very fantastic feelings.

So, Marie-Noémie. Another NomCom-appointed councilor. I really didn't think ... To go through the full list because I'm afraid to miss somebody and not to say how much I appreciate all your support and your participation. Yeah, especially I'd like to talk about all those five councilors, four councilors who are leaving. I miss you guys. I miss you guys, and I want to be with you.

No, Nick. Nick is another councilor who somehow—I don't know, maybe—yeah, some difficult to see on the list. I learned a lot from Nick because he's so calm, so knowledgeable and never misses the point. He thinks before talking, and this is something I need to learn, too, which is difficult. I'd better talk without thinking because if I thought for a minute, I would have finished ten minutes ago. I really didn't mean to talk for ages about all the people I love, I miss, and I really would have wanted to hug here.

There are still so many very supportive and wise people from community who have joined the call today, and if I start listing them, we will never finish. And I know that we have only one minute to go.

So, I will say no more because no words can express everything that I feel about each and every one of you. So, thank you so much again. And it was a very rewarding experience for me. So, thank you. Thanks, again.

And with that—with one or half a minute to go—let me call this meeting to an end and thank you, once more.

Okay, thank you. And next time, Alejandra, the floor is yours.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you.

JORDAN CARTER: Thank, Katrina.

KATRINA SATAKI: Sorry for the long speech. I didn't mean to talk so long there, but it just happened like always.

PABLO RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, all.

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay. Thanks a lot. Thank you.

DAVID OLIVE: Thank you. Thank you very much.

YOUNG-EUM LEE: Bye, everyone. Bye.

DAVID OLIVE: Bye.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: Bye.

LAURA MARGOLIS: Bye.

KATRINA SATAKI: Bye.

KATRINA SATAKI: Patricio, bye.

DESIREE MILOSHEVIC: Bye.

BIYI OLADIPO: Bye.

SOULEYMANE OUMTANAGA: [inaudible], bye.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay, bye. Bye, Souleymane.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. Have a great rest of the day.

SOULEYMAN OUMTANAGA: Thank you very much.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]